CHARACTERIZING ISOTOPIC VARIATION OF A TROPICAL SEA BIRD, THE WHITE TERN GYGIS ALBA

NORINE W. YEUNG1,2, DAVID C. DUFFY3 & SHEILA CONANT2

1Center for Conservation Research and Training, Pacific Biosciences Research Center, University of Hawai‘i, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA (nyeung@hawaii.edu)
2Department of Biology, University of Hawai‘i, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA
3Pacific Cooperative Studies Unit, Department of Botany, University of Hawai‘i, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA

Received 21 July 2013, accepted 28 April 2014

SUMMARY


Understanding a species’ feeding ecology is important in understanding the impacts of disturbances to populations (e.g. pollution, declines in fisheries and climate change). Seabirds have been used as bioindicators of such disturbances, and their diets have been examined using stable isotopes throughout the Atlantic and Indian Ocean and more recently in the Pacific Ocean. In this study, carbon (δ13C) and nitrogen (δ15N) isotope ratios were examined in different feather types from a pantropical Charadriiform, the White Tern Gygis alba within the Hawaiian Archipelago. No difference was found within single feathers (base and tip) or between primary and breast feathers. This lack of variation among feather types within an individual indicates that either type could be used as an indicator of the status of an individual and that diet remained fairly constant throughout the year. Therefore, use of molted primary feathers for future analysis would be less invasive than capturing individuals to obtain blood or breast feather samples. Carbon and nitrogen isotope values for White Terns were similar to those of skipjack tuna Katsuwonus pelamis and yellowfin tuna Thunnus albacares, indicating that White Terns fed on prey similar to that of both species of tuna. The White Tern does not migrate, often feeding in association with predatory fish such as tuna, so that changes in its stable isotopes may reflect interannual changes in the abundance of tuna.

Key words: carbon-13, nitrogen-15, Pacific Ocean, trophic level, Thunnus albacares, Katsuwonus pelamis

INTRODUCTION

The study of stable isotopes of oxygen, carbon, nitrogen, hydrogen and sulfur can elucidate patterns in food webs, informing a broad range of ecological studies on topics such as feeding, dispersal, migratory routes and element cycling (e.g. Hobson & Clark 1992, Hobson 1999, Vanderklift & Ponsard 2003, Fry 2006). Because of predictable offsets in stable carbon (δ13C) and nitrogen (δ15N) isotope values between consumers and their diet, comparison of isotope data from predators and potential prey can provide information on nutrient sources, foraging location, migration patterns, trophic relationships and energy flow (Rubenstein & Hobson 2004, Fry 2006). The isotopic ratio of nitrogen exhibits a stepwise enrichment of about 3‰–5‰ at each trophic level in marine systems (e.g. DeNiro & Epstein 1981, Hobson & Clark 1992, Bearhop et al. 2002). The isotopic ratio of carbon shows an increase with trophic level by ca. 1‰ (e.g. DeNiro & Epstein 1978) and can be used to distinguish inshore (enriched in 13C) versus offshore food sources (Hobson et al. 1994).

Stable isotopes have been particularly useful for diet studies, in which they can supplement or replace more intrusive methods such as the collection of regurgitates, stomach flushing and/or the collection of whole specimens. Such traditional approaches in avian studies require access to breeding colonies and handling of birds, which may cause the birds temporary harm or death (Duffy & Jackson 1986). Feathers, muscles and blood are the most commonly used tissues for analyzing stable isotopes in birds (Rubenstein & Hobson 2004). Because cells in different tissues turn over at different rates, they can provide dietary information at different geographical and temporal scales (Hobson & Clark 1992, Hobson 1999, Bearhop et al. 2002). For example, liver, muscle, and blood have faster turnover rates compared to long-lived and inert tissues such as feathers, hair and bone, so their components may reflect different foraging environments (Tieszen et al. 1983; Hobson & Clark 1992; Haramis et al. 2001; Bearhop et al. 2002, 2003; Pearson et al. 2003). Breast feathers are often used for analysis because of their ease of collection and overall isotope average to other tissues, and they have been used to represent isotopic ratios from the individual as a whole (Thompson & Furness 1995, Smith et al. 2008).

Seabird diet and feeding ecology have been investigated using stable isotopes in temperate and polar waters (Thompson et al. 1999) as well as in the tropical Atlantic and Indian oceans (Jaquemet et al. 2004, Cherel et al. 2008). Studies have also been conducted in the North Pacific, primarily of Procellariiformes (petrels and shearwaters) and Pelecaniformes (boobies, frigatebirds and tropicbirds; Hobson et al. 1994, Ramos et al. 2002, Wiley et al. 2013a, b). Several isotopic studies (e.g. Bond & Diamond 2011) of Charadriiformes (specifically, terns and noddies) have been published recently (e.g. Young et al. 2010), but few of these studies have investigated tropical Pacific Charadriiformes.

White Terns are non-migratory pantropical seabirds (Niethammer & Patrick 1998). They are opportunistic predators, primarily taking fish and squid 10–50 mm long (Harrison et al. 1983, Ashmole & Ashmole 1967, Spear et al. 2007). They frequently feed on prey driven to the surface by predatory fish such as Thunnus spp. and
Katsuwonus pelamis (skipjack tuna; Dorward 1963, Harrison et al. 1983, Au & Pitman 1986, Harrison & Seki 1987, Spear et al. 2007). Within the Hawaiian Archipelago, White Terns have been observed feeding more closely with skipjack tuna than with Thunnus albacares (yellowfin tuna; Spear et al. 2007, Hebski et al. 2008). However, in other areas in the Pacific Ocean, they have been observed feeding also with yellowfin tuna (Acevedo and Wursig 1991, Ballance and Pitman 1999). Tuna and other top predators in marine ecosystems have been the target of major commercial fisheries in the Pacific Ocean since the 1950s, and some stocks have been severely overexploited (Harrison 1990, Tuck & Bulman 2003) while others may be increasing and expanding their ranges because of anthropogenic climate change (Loukos et al. 2003, Polovina et al. 2011). These climatic and anthropogenic impacts may have major consequences for birds such as White Terns that feed in association with subsurface predators (Ballance & Pitman 1999, Spear et al. 2007).

This study establishes a baseline for stable isotopes in the White Tern Gygis alba. We compare nitrogen and carbon isotope variation within and among feather types (primaries and breast feather) of this species from the Hawaiian Archipelago. Because the feeding strategy of this seabird involves subsurface predators such as tuna, we compared the isotopic signatures of the White Tern with those of the yellowfin and skipjack tuna occurring in the area where tern tissues were sampled. This isotopic baseline of White Terns from the Hawaiian Archipelago will provide the necessary information to evaluate potential changes in dietary habits resulting from the continual decline of fisheries and future climate change.

STUDY AREA AND METHODS

Nine White Tern corpses were salvaged (Table 1; n = 2, Oahu; n = 3, French Frigate Shoals; n = 4, Midway Atoll) during September–November 2006 and breast feathers, base and tips of primaries 1, 4 and 7 (primary 1 = innermost), were taken. An additional 12 molted primary feathers were collected from under nesting trees on Oahu and five from Midway Atoll for tip and base (intrafeather) comparison.

Feathers were cleaned of any external debris in an ultrasonic bath with de-ionized water, and lipids were removed using a chloroform methanol 2:1 wash (Cherel et al. 2005). Samples were then dried for 24–48 h at 50°C at least 24 h prior to isotopic analysis. Approximately 3 mm each from the extreme base and tip of feathers (vanes only) were used for analysis. No samples were homogenized as there was enough mass for each sample analysis. Carbon and nitrogen isotope compositions of samples (0.3–0.5 mg) were determined using an in-line carbon-nitrogen analyzer coupled with an isotope ratio mass spectrometer (Finnigan ConFlo II/Delta-Plus). Isotope values were reported in standard delta-notation relative to an international standard. Standards were V-PDB and atmospheric N₂ for carbon and nitrogen, respectively. A glycine standard was used to ensure accuracy of all isotope measurements. Several samples were measured in duplicate or triplicate, and the analytical error associated with these measurements was typically < 0.2‰. Statistical analysis was done in Minitab13.

RESULTS

There were no significant differences in nitrogen (paired t-test, \( t = 1.56, 22 \text{ df}, P = 0.134 \)) and carbon (paired t-test, \( t = 1.48, 22 \text{ df}, P = 0.152 \)) isotope values between the tips and bases of primary feathers. There was no significant difference in nitrogen values among primaries (tips only) either (Friedman test; \( \chi^2_{25} = 1.37, P = 0.504 \)). However, there was a significant difference in carbon isotope values among primaries (Friedman test; \( \chi^2_{25} = 8.40, P = 0.015 \)). Additionally, there was significant variation in nitrogen (paired t-test, \( t = 3.03, 7 \text{ df}, P = 0.019 \)) between primary

### TABLE 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tissue</th>
<th>1 (Oahu)</th>
<th>2 (Oahu)</th>
<th>3 (FFS)</th>
<th>4a (FFS)</th>
<th>5 (FFS)</th>
<th>6 (Midway)</th>
<th>7a (Midway)</th>
<th>8a (Midway)</th>
<th>9a (Midway)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary 1 (tip)</td>
<td>-14.75</td>
<td>-14.41</td>
<td>-14.54</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>-14.29</td>
<td>-15.33</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>-14.66</td>
<td>0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 7 (tip)</td>
<td>-14.30</td>
<td>-14.36</td>
<td>-14.32</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>-11.05</td>
<td>-15.24</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>-13.85</td>
<td>1.62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*aSeveral primaries were missing from these salvaged birds and were not used for comparison of primaries.

FFS = French Frigate Shoals.

In general, oceanic tropical marine systems are characterized by low productivity and little seasonal variation (Longhurst & Pauly 1987), which could lead to little variation in the diets of marine predators throughout the year. The White Tern is considered non-migratory, and individuals can be found breeding at any time of the year (Niethammer & Patrick 1998). The lack of isotope variation in the primary feathers analyzed, despite full replacement occurring over several months, supports the idea that the White Tern feeds in similar food webs in the same area year-round. Additionally, White Tern breast and primary feathers had similar isotopic ratios, despite the time scale at which they are molted, so, at least in this species, both feather types can serve as an accurate representation of the isotopic measurements of individual birds. Therefore, using molted feathers for this species provides a less invasive source for isotopic analysis than collecting breast feathers and flight feathers from the live bird.

Assuming a trophic shift at 3.0‰, White Tern δ15N values fell within the same trophic level as those of juvenile and adult yellowfin tuna occurring around the Hawaiian Islands (Table 1; Graham et al. 2007). Nitrogen isotope values of white muscle tissue from tuna < 45.0 cm standard length (SL) were reported at 6.7 ± 0.6‰ while those of tuna ≥ 45.0 cm SL were 10.2 ± 1.8‰. Carbon isotope values of tuna < 45.0 cm was reported at -17.3 ± 0.5‰ and those ≥ 45.0 cm at 17.8 ± 0.8‰ (Graham et al. 2007). The isotopic signature of adult yellowfin tuna was significantly higher than that of the juveniles, probably because adults had bigger gape sizes and were faster, so they were able to pursue and consume larger prey. Although White Terns feed more closely with skipjack tuna than yellowfin tuna within the Hawaiian Archipelago (e.g. Spear et al. 2007, Hebshi et al. 2008), it has been shown that skipjack and yellowfin tuna feed within the same trophic level throughout the Pacific Ocean (Rau 1981, Cherel et al. 2008, Bugoni et al. 2010).

To our knowledge, there are no isotopic studies regarding terns and noddies (Sterninae) within the Hawaiian Archipelago, and this study can serve as a comparison for future research on this group. However, in comparison with Hawaiian Procóllariformes, White Terns feed at the same trophic level as adult Bulwer’s petrels and as adult and chicks of Christmas shearwaters (Bond et al. 2010, Spear et al. 2007) but forage closer to shore. Recently, based on diet and observation, it has been proposed that Newell’s Shearwaters Puffinus newelli in Hawaiian waters may also be part of this assemblage feeding in association with yellowfin tuna (Ainley et al. 2014).

Changes in tuna populations because of natural or anthropogenic climate change would affect the frequency of opportunities for White Terns to forage on the prey that predatory fish drive to the surface (Spear et al. 2007). Regular monitoring of seabird diets would help identify changes in the abundance and distribution of tuna and other predatory fish. Use of molted feathers would allow routine sampling at a scale and frequency not always possible through other methods.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This work was part of N.W.Y.’s dissertation at the Department of Zoology, University of Hawai’i and supported by the National Science Foundation (Ecology, Evolution, and Conservation Biology program of the University of Hawai’i – NSF grant #05385500 and DGE02-32016 to K.Y. Kaneshiro and Hawaiian land snail biodiversity: Systematics, phylogenetics and conservation status of a vanishing fauna – NSF grant #1120906 to K.A. Hayes), University of Hawai’i Foundation Life History, Ecology and Conservation of Native Hawaiian Birds Fund, and the Hawai’i Audubon Society. We are very grateful to Eric VanderWerf, Corinne Chun Fujimoto, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Services and Hawai’i Department of Land and Natural Resources for the collection of samples. We also thank the following for their input, support, and assistance: Brian Bowen, Heather Eijzenga, Brittany Graham, Kenneth Hayes, David Lin, Andrea McClung, Marty Meyer, Cliff Morden, Brian Popp, Terri Rust, Laurie Strommer, Andy Taylor, Natalie Walsgrove, Les Watling, Ricky Yeung, Irene Yeung, Remi and Martin Yeung. This work was conducted under all necessary institutional, state, and federal wildlife permits.

**REFERENCES**


